

# Public Sector Leaders

## Overview of Research

Although public sector leaders are typically not as well known to the general population as elected officials, they play a pivotal role in shaping the way governments operate.

The importance of the demographic make-up of the public service, especially at the most senior levels, is well understood to be fundamental to democracy. The term “representative bureaucracy” was coined by J. Donald Kingsley in 1944, who wrote:

the democratic State cannot afford to exclude any considerable body of its citizens from full participation in its affairs. It requires at every point that superior insight and wisdom which is the peculiar product of the pooling of diverse streams of experience. In this lies the strength of representative government. Upon it depends the superiority of the democratic Civil Service over its totalitarian rivals. In a democracy, competence alone is not enough. The public service must also be representative if the State is to liberate rather than enslave (Evans et al., 2008).

The specific benefits of diversity in the public service include:

- A symbolic commitment to diverse and equal access to power;
- A broader range of experiences and knowledge available to the decision-making process;
- The ability to influence the process of agenda-setting and prioritization within the administrative state;
- A greater potential for the increased cooperation of traditionally under-represented groups with government as trust is built; and
- The broadening of the number of candidates who may be considered for public service appointments (Evans et al., 2008).

A national study of Deputy Ministers and Assistant Deputy Ministers in Canadian governments revealed that in 2006 only 4.2% of the sample identified themselves as visible minorities. More specifically, 16 % of the territorial, 5% of the federal, and 3% of the provincial samples identified as visible minorities (Evans et al., 2008).

At the municipal level, data recently released indicates that the Toronto Police Service has been making steady progress, with minorities comprising 10% of senior officers, 17% of all officers and 22% of civilians. A workforce survey of City of Toronto staff in 2007 indicated that 14% are visible minorities (James, 2009).

## Methodology

Our study builds on previous research by focusing specifically on the GTA and the most senior executive positions in organizations. Municipal executives were selected according to the municipality's own definition of its senior-most public service members, although administrative structures and position titles vary by municipality. Chief Administrative Officer, City Manager, Deputy City Manager, and Commissioner were included in the tally<sup>1</sup> as well as police executives

---

<sup>1</sup> The City of Toronto is administratively headed by a City Manager and three Deputy City Managers. Reporting to them are the heads of 41 City Divisions holding a wide range of titles. We did not include division heads in our data collection.

(Chiefs and Deputy Chiefs), Ontario Deputy Ministers and Assistant Deputy Ministers. We assessed the entire Peel and York regions as well as the five municipalities, as certain roles are responsible for an entire region. For example, the police forces for the Peel and York regions are responsible for entire regions as opposed to individual municipalities.

We identified municipal and regional executives through an online search of specific municipalities and/or regions. If relevant data could not be found on the municipality’s website, we conducted a name search to locate demographic data. We identified Police Chiefs and Deputy Police Chiefs through an online search of each city or region’s respective police force website. Finally, we identified Ontario Deputy Ministers and Assistant Deputy Ministers by name and position title from the Ontario Government website (Service Ontario, 2008) which was followed by an online search for demographic data.

Of the 199 public sector leaders, we reviewed data on 123 leaders (62%).

### Findings

Generally, visible minorities have not risen to the most senior leadership roles in the civil service compared to their achievements in elected office. At the municipal level, they are only 4% of the executive committee members for which data were collected, 8% of police executives (although this is a small number—one of twelve) and 10% of provincial Deputy Ministers and Assistant Deputy Ministers.

Table 9 provides a breakdown of visible minority representation among municipal officials as compared to the visible minority population of the municipality and region they represent.

**Table 9: Visible Minorities in the Public Sector – Municipal and Regional Senior Executives**

| <b>Municipal and Regional Executives</b> | <b>Population % Visible Minority</b> | <b>Total Number</b> | <b>Total Analyzed</b> | <b># Visible Minority</b> | <b>% Visible Minority</b> |
|--|--------------------------------------|---------------------|-----------------------|---------------------------|---------------------------|
| City of Toronto*                         | 47%                                  | 4                   | 2                     | 0                         | 0%                        |
| York Region                              | 37%                                  | 7                   | 7                     | 0                         | 0%                        |
| Region of Peel                           | 50%                                  | 6                   | 6                     | 0                         | 0%                        |
| Town of Richmond* Hill                   | 45.7%                                | 4                   | NA                    | NA                        | <b>NA</b>                 |
| Town of Markham                          | 65.4%                                | 4                   | 3                     | 0                         | 0%                        |
| City of Mississauga*                     | 49%                                  | 5                   | 2                     | 0                         | 0%                        |
| City of Brampton                         | 57%                                  | 8                   | 8                     | 1                         | 13%                       |
| <b>Total</b>                             |                                      | <b>38</b>           | <b>28</b>             | <b>1</b>                  | <b>4%</b>                 |

\*data were available for less than 50% of the executive committee members

The representation of visible minorities among Police Chiefs and Deputy Chiefs is analyzed in Table 10. In the three regions, one Deputy Police Chief is a visible minority, which represents 8% of police executives.

**Table 10: Visible Minorities in the Public Sector – Police Chiefs and Deputy Chiefs**

| Police Chiefs and Deputy Chiefs | Population % Visible Minority | Total Number | Total Analyzed | # Visible Minority | % Visible Minority |
|---------------------------------|-------------------------------|--------------|----------------|--------------------|--------------------|
| Toronto Police Service          | 47%                           | 5            | 5              | 1                  | 20%                |
| Peel Regional Police            | 50%                           | 4            | 4              | 0                  | 0%                 |
| York Regional Police            | 37%                           | 3            | 3              | 0                  | 0%                 |
| <b>Total</b>                    | <b>45.8%</b>                  | <b>12</b>    | <b>12</b>      | <b>1</b>           | <b>8%</b>          |

Table 11 illustrates the breakdown of visible minority representation among Deputy Ministers and Assistant Deputy Ministers in the Ontario Government. A total of 9% of Assistant Deputy Ministers and 11% of Deputy Ministers were visible minorities.

**Table 11: Visible Minorities in the Public Sector – Deputy and Assistant Deputy Ministers**

| Deputy Ministers (DMs) & Assistant Deputy Ministers (ADMs) | Total Number | Total Analyzed | # Visible Minority | % Visible Minority |
|--|--------------|----------------|--------------------|--------------------|
| ADMs*  | 116          | 56             | 5                  | 9%                 |
| DMs  | 33           | 27             | 3                  | 11%                |
| <b>Total</b>   | <b>149</b>   | <b>83</b>      | <b>8</b>           | <b>10%</b>         |

\*data were available for less than 50% of ADMs

Table 12 is an overall analysis of visible minority representation in the public sector. In total, data were collected for 123 leaders in this sector and 8% were identified as visible minorities.

**Table 12: Visible Minorities in the Public Sector**

| Public Sector                     | Total Number | Total Analyzed | # Visible Minority | % Visible Minority |
|-----------------------------------|--------------|----------------|--------------------|--------------------|
| Municipal and Regional Executives | 38           | 28             | 1                  | 4%                 |
| Police Chiefs and Deputy Chiefs   | 12           | 12             | 1                  | 8%                 |
| ADMs and DMs                      | 149          | 83             | 8                  | 10%                |
| <b>Total</b>                      | <b>199</b>   | <b>123</b>     | <b>10</b>          | <b>8%</b>          |

Overall, the representation of visible minorities is quite low in this category. Although the average visible minority representation of the GTA population is 40%, Brampton was the only municipality with visible minority leaders (13%) among its executive staff. Among Police Chiefs and Deputy Chiefs, the City of Toronto is the only police force with at least one visible minority in a senior executive role.

### Leading Practices

Much has been written about the need to ensure higher representation among public service leaders (Conference Board of Canada, 2004; Evans et al., 2008; Galabuzi, 2001; Jain & Hackett, 1989) and strategies to achieve increased representation.

The key elements of an effective diversity strategy are similar across sectors and must address the following:

*Senior leadership commitment:* It is important to ensure that diversity is not a matter left to the human resources department. Senior leaders across the civil service must understand and communicate its importance to all staff not just in the language of equity and inclusiveness but in terms of diversity’s strategic importance to service delivery and to skilled worker recruitment and retention.

*Measuring and establishing targets:* Most government departments collect data but its utility varies considerably. Obtaining self-identification is often a challenge, sometimes because employees fear being targeted or singled out or because they worry about backlash. Careful attention to how information is collected and how the efforts around diversity data are communicated are essential. Tying self-identification to employee engagement surveys can work, if employees believe that it will make a difference. The Government of Ontario has recently coupled its employment engagement survey with self-identification data in an effort to more effectively benchmark and track progress.

*Targeted recruitment strategies and succession planning:* In all sectors, consideration needs to be given to identifying, attracting and retaining well-qualified visible minorities. Outreach through ethno-cultural organizations on campus and in the community as well as through ethnic media can provide new sources of talent. In fact, the Toronto Police Service has used this strategy to increase its pool of visible minority employees.

*Development, retention and promotional strategies:* Providing additional professional development and training opportunities where there may be particular skill needs, such as cross-cultural communication and negotiation for example, are part of an effective strategy. Developing formal networking and mentoring programs for under-represented groups championed by senior managers are also effective. The Ontario Public Service, for example, pairs deputy ministers with employees who are visible minorities or from under-represented groups.

*Mainstreaming diversity:* Diversity training and awareness throughout the organization are essential to creating an inclusive environment where visible minority leaders can progress and succeed. Examining the implications of diversity through the organization and communicating the case for diversity in relations with all stakeholders—suppliers, educational institutions, media and partners – helps to promote a culture of inclusion and also to shape the image of the organization as an appealing place to work. For example, the Toronto Police Service has recently undertaken an ambitious project to assess the implications of diversity and human rights through every aspect of the organization. York Regional Police has been a high profile partner on a number of diversity initiatives in order to promote its image as an employer of choice.

## Leadership in Action

### **Fareed Amin, Deputy Minister, Municipal Affairs and Housing**

*Fareed Amin is currently Ontario’s Deputy Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing, responsible for local governments, land use planning, affordable housing and building regulation in Ontario.*

*With over twenty years in the public sector, Amin held a number of other Deputy Ministerial portfolios in Ontario, including Deputy Minister of the Ministry of*

*International Trade and Investment, Deputy Minister of Economic Development, Deputy Minister of Citizenship and Immigration and Deputy Minister of Intergovernmental Affairs.*

*Amin also worked in the municipal sector. Between 2004 and 2006, he served as the Deputy City Manager, City of Toronto. During his tenure at the City of Toronto, he was responsible for a capital budget of \$1 billion, an operating budget of \$2 billion, and approximately 10,000 staff. His role provided governance and corporate oversight of Water and Wastewater, City Planning, Solid Waste Management, Transportation, Building, Fire, Environment, and the Waterfront Secretariat.*

*Previously Amin held progressively senior positions in the Ministry of Municipal Affairs, the Ministry of Northern Development and Mines, the Ministry of Transportation, the Ministry of Finance, the Premier's Office and Cabinet Office.*

*He has an undergraduate degree in Geography and Planning, a Certificate in Public Administration and a Master's degree in Public Administration. He is also a graduate of an intensive leadership program at Kennedy School of Government at Harvard University.*

**Amin's advice to aspiring leaders:** "Adopt the principle of continuous learning, develop collaborative and respectful relationships with staff at all levels in the organization."

### **Keith Forde, Deputy Chief (Human Resource Command), Toronto Police Service**

*Keith Forde joined the Toronto Police Service in 1972. During his 34-year policing career, he has had uniform, investigative, and undercover drug operation duties. Forde was appointed Deputy Chief of Police in August 2005 and placed in charge of Human Resources Command, with a staff of more than 400 civilian and uniform officers - a position he still holds. Forde is City of Toronto's first visible minority Deputy Chief of Police.*

*Despite three decades of policing experience and leadership, Forde remains committed to personal learning and growth. Through the course of his extensive career, he has completed several post-secondary certificates in various disciplines, which he suggests help him to adapt and relate to his diverse constituency. Forde is a tireless community worker and fundraiser, and has received numerous awards from community organizations, government agencies, faith groups and his own police service.*

*Forde has been recognized as a role model for the African Canadian community. Among the long list of accolades, Forde has received the Harry Jerome Trailblazer Award, the African Canadian Achievement Award, Jamaica Community Award and the Chief of Police Excellence Award.*

**Forde's advice to aspiring leaders:** "Whether you believe that you can or you can't—you're right!"